WILLIAMSBURG ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES Tuesday, May 8, 2007

The regular semi-monthly meeting of the Williamsburg Architectural Review Board was held on Tuesday, May 8, 2007 at 6:30 p.m. in the Williamsburg Municipal Building, 401 Lafayette Street.

CALL TO ORDER AND ATTENDANCE

Chairman Spence called the meeting to order. Present in addition to Mr. Spence were Board members Messrs. Edwards, Hertzler, Klee and Lane. Absent was Board member Kent. Mr. Quarles arrived late. Staff members Deputy Planning Director Murphy and Secretary Scott were present.

Consent Agenda

Chairman Spence explained the consent agenda procedure to the audience stating that if an application is in full compliance with the **Design Review Guidelines**, it is placed on the consent agenda. If no member of the Board has any question regarding the application and concurs that it is in full compliance with the *Guidelines*, the audience is asked if they are present to discuss any case on the Consent Agenda. If there is no one in the audience present to discuss any item on the Consent Agenda, those applications are approved as submitted and the applicants dismissed without further discussion.

Applications on tonight's Consent Agenda:

ARB #07-037 Hueskamp/310 Burns Lane – Addition to single-family dwelling

SIGN #07-024 Alize' Bistro/A. Carroll's Martini & Wine Bar/601 Prince George Street - Freestanding Sign

SIGN #07-025 Chesapeake Bank/1229 Lafayette Street – Monument, Building & Awning

Mr. Lane asked that ARB #07-035 Gibbs/209 Indian Springs Road – Exterior Change (windows, shutters and storm door) be removed from the consent agenda for further discussion.

There being no additional questions or comments from the Board or the audience regarding the cases on the Consent Agenda, Mr. Spence moved that the remaining cases be approved as submitted. Mr. Hertzler seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 5-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Hertzler, Klee, Spence

Nay: None

Absent: Quarles, Kent

ARCHITECTURAL PRESERVATION DISTRICT

ARB #07-035 Gibbs/209 Indian Springs Road – Exterior Change (windows, shutters and storm door) – Approved

Mr. Lane asked owner, Pat Gibbs, of what material the new hopper windows will be made and she answered that the best hopper windows she could find are vinyl windows; however, they will be concealed by new wooden louvers painted white.

[Mr. Quarles arrived.]

Mr. Spence noted that no vinyl or aluminum is permitted in this preservation zone. Mr. Klee said that one of the purposes of this review board is to try to preserve what is already there, or as close to it as possible and the Board needs to evaluate the louvers because they will be visible from the road. Mr. Klee added that an exception is fully warranted in this case because of the louvers; he then moved that the changes be approved as submitted. He added that the applicant is encouraged to use aluminum-clad hopper windows in the basement. Mr. Edwards seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 6-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Hertzler, Klee, Spence, Quarles

Nay: None Absent: Kent

ARB #07-036 Payne/308 South Boundary Street – Exterior Change (revisions to previously approved window plans) – Approved with Conditions

Virginia Payne, owner, Chris Crone, representing the owner, and Jeff Barra, Toano Designs, were present to respond to any questions. Mr. Barra said that after finding the windows approved by the Board to be very costly because of the building code requirement for tempered glass, the applicant is returning with revised plans. The changes proposed:

- Front elevation detached garage remove personal door and center garage door
- Rear elevation detached garage remove two 8/12 windows
- Left elevation detached garage Replace four 8/12 windows with two 9/9 windows
- Rear elevation dwelling replace two 6/9 windows with one 6/6 window in gable end; replace two 6/9 windows on second floor elevation with one 6/6 window
- Left side elevation dwelling replace larger 6/9 windows in rear gable with smaller 6/9 windows and one 6/6 window on the second floor
- Right side elevation dwelling second floor elevation remove one 6/9 window in hyphen and one 6/9 window in the gable; remove one 6/9 window on the first floor elevation.

ARB Minutes May 8, 2007 Page 3

Discussion followed regarding the proposed decreased number, size and placement of the windows. Mr. Crone noted that although changes in the windows previously approved are requested, the trim will be retained. He added that the window manufacturer they had planned to use, *Marvin*, doesn't meet egress requirements, however, *Pella* does. Board members suggested window placement for better symmetry and alignment.

Mr. Hertzler moved that the proposed revisions be approved with the condition that the dwelling rear window be moved to align with the interior French door below. Mr. Lane seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 6-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Hertzler, Quarles, Klee, Spence

Nay: None Absent: Kent

ARB #07-038 Braxton/128 Braxton Court – Additions & Alterations to single-family dwelling – Approved with Conditions

Applicant/owner Bobby Braxton and Paul White, Paul White Designer and Associates, were present and distributed a revised site plan to the Board members. Mr. White noted that the shutters will be painted wood, five fold, folding on themselves and the hardware will be workable, and the dog ears will be stepped out a bit. The proposal is for vinyl-clad wooden windows, with simulated true divided lights. Mrs. Murphy stated that the muntins need to be exterior. Mr. White showed the Board a sample of the proposed mossy green roof. There will be a standing seam copper roof installed over the sunroom as well as green awnings.

Among the Board's comments were:

- The Board will need to actually see a drawing of the proposed railing for the rear deck.
- The hardware for the shutters is prominent, but not in keeping with the rest of the house. Mr. White said the applicant wouldn't object to another system.
- The design of the porch columns was discussed and Mr. Klee said that because
 the porch and columns will be seen from the street, it would be nice to see a
 drawing of them.
- A fiberglass garage door is proposed with vinyl trim, but Mr. Quarles read from the *Guidelines* which state a garage door in this preservation zone should be painted wood or aluminum and should correspond with the style of the dwelling. Mr. Hertzler added that the door looks too smooth, too vinyl-looking.
- Nice looking plans; the key is in the materials; hollow PVC columns are not permitted.

Gladys Victor, 704 Powell Street, asked if the changes to this home will render it ineligible for listing on the National Register. Mr. Quarles stated that although one of the main functions of this Board is preservation, the standing or potential standing on the National Register is not part of the decision per se; something can be approved

ARB Minutes May 8, 2007 Page 4

even if it would preclude the house from being eligible. Mr. Klee said this is an addition to an historic house and it's up to the state to decide if the renovation compromises it's integrity. He stated that the Board's *Design Review Guidelines* and the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings* are *guided* by the National Register Listing. The applicant said he is not interested in the house being listed on the National Register; the preservation of the house is to ensure the preservation of his family's history. Mr. Klee noted that in comparison, the Armistead House renovation is held to more restrictive guidelines because they are seeking tax credits and listing on the National Register.

Victor Smith, 140 Chandler Court, asked for clarification of the Board's policy for materials and Mr. Klee responded that the Board tries to reasonably assess a proposed new material, even though the particular material may not be addressed in the *Design Review Guidelines*.

Mr. Spence moved that the proposal be approved as submitted with the exception of the railings and columns. The applicant was asked to return to the Board with renderings of these two items. The motion was seconded and carried by roll call vote of 6-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Hertzler, Quarles, Klee, Spence

Nay: None Absent: Kent

CORRIDOR PROTECTION DISTRICT

None

SIGNS

SIGN #07-021 Waterfall Ice/Mug-A-Bytes/1660 Richmond Road – Approved with Conditions

At the last meeting the Board had asked the applicant to return with a simplified design for the sign and a sketch of the small cart for the patio and although the applicant was not present due to a family emergency, the Board decided to review the revised proposal because the requested items have been submitted.

Mr. Hertzler said there is still too much information crammed on the small sign.

Mr. Spence moved that the revised proposal be approved contingent upon the waterfall ice logo on the cart being removed. Mr. Edwards seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 6-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Hertzler, Quarles, Klee, Spence

Nay: None Absent: Kent

ARCHITECTURAL PRESERVATION DISTRICT

ARB #07-034 Sarantokos/520 Newport Avenue – Exterior Change (front door) – Tabled

There being no representative present, Mr. Spence moved to table the request. Mr. Klee seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote of 6-0.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Edwards, Lane, Hertzler, Klee, Spence, Quarles

Nay: None Absent: Kent

OTHER

Minutes for April 24, 2007

The minutes for the April 24, 2007 meeting were approved viva voce.

Alternative Energy

The Board has copies of a letter from John Fitzhugh Millar, 710 South Henry Street, and City Manager, Jack Tuttle's response, regarding alternative, renewable energy systems, e.g. roof-top solar panels, back yard windmills. Mrs. Murphy stated that she will gather information from other jurisdictions and report back to the Board. Mr. Hertzler stated that even now there is "green architecture" where a living membrane that allows items to grow is available and can be installed on a flat roof.

There being no further business the meeting adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

Dee Scott Secretary